

Why Notes Always Reach

Their Destination (at Least Once)

in Schubert's Winterreise

For some time, I have had the feeling that Schubert uses motivic, modal, metrical, textural, and harmonic musical materials to represent both conventional subjective structures and what happens when they come under strain in his song cycle *Winterreise*. A psychoanalytic approach to *destination* provides the means for describing such structures. The first register of destination represents setting up conventional materials; the second register of destination represents conventional structures ruptured by traumatic shock.

Music theory can specify how music embodies a wide variety of listening registers, and it is crucial in describing *Winterreise* as a musical representation of psychoanalytic destination. Music theory ranges from elementary harmonic descriptive labels (as in the previous chapters) to more sophisticated transformational tools such as Schenkerian voice-leading graphs. This chapter relies implicitly on Schenkerian concepts in musical-theoretical analysis; they will be used explicitly in the next chapter on Schubert and the gaze.

Within a movement of Western tonal art music, Schenkerian music theorists speak of notes reaching their destination when pitches in the fundamental melodic line descend to tonic at the final cadence. This teleological approach to pitch structure is based on the works of such common-practice composers as Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven, in which the two harmonic motions of tonic to dominant and dominant to tonic support a melodic line that outlines the tonic *key* and ends on the tonic *note* at a deep structural level.¹ Recent theorists have

3

*Why Notes Always Reach**Their Destination (at Least Once)**in Schubert's Winterreise*

For some time, I have had the feeling that Schubert uses motivic, modal, metrical, textural, and harmonic musical materials to represent both conventional subjective structures and what happens when they come under strain in his song cycle *Winterreise*. A psychoanalytic approach to *destination* provides the means for describing such structures. The first register of destination represents setting up conventional materials; the second register of destination represents conventional structures ruptured by traumatic shock.

Music theory can specify how music embodies a wide variety of listening registers, and it is crucial in describing *Winterreise* as a musical representation of psychoanalytic destination. Music theory ranges from elementary harmonic descriptive labels (as in the previous chapters) to more sophisticated transformational tools such as Schenkerian voice-leading graphs. This chapter relies implicitly on Schenkerian concepts in musical-theoretical analysis; they will be used explicitly in the next chapter on Schubert and the gaze.

Within a movement of Western tonal art music, Schenkerian music theorists speak of notes reaching their destination when pitches in the fundamental melodic line descend to tonic at the final cadence. This ecological approach to pitch structure is based on the works of such common-practice composers as Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven, which the two harmonic motions of tonic to dominant and dominant to tonic support a melodic line that outlines the tonic *key* and ends on the tonic *note* at a deep structural level.¹ Recent theorists have

extended Schenker's diatonic notion of musical structure in studies of the works of later composers such as Schubert, Schumann, and Wagner. Despite the fact that ambiguous, chromatic structures trouble the clarity of the tonic-dominant/dominant-tonic structural binary discussed above, these theorists show how local musical materials inform larger aspects of structure. Or, after ambiguous wanderings, notes also reach their destination in Romantic and post-Romantic music.²

While much of the material that follows relies on these hermeneutic theories of diatonic and chromatic destination, I will supplement this approach with a psychoanalytic theory of destination to theorize relations among literary texts, Schubert's musical settings of these texts, and psychoanalytic registers. In general, so much nineteenth-century music seems to be about hearing things within the voice, moving in and out of distinct phases of musical representation, blurring formal, subjective, and syntactic boundaries.³ For me, *Winterreise* is all about such issues. In particular, I am interested in describing the musical representation of conventionality and traumatic shock using Žižek's Lacanian notion of destination.⁴

Schubert's two great song cycles, *Die schöne Müllerin* and *Winterreise*, are works that explore fantasies of love in text and music at both the individual song and the cycle level.⁵ Both cycles are musical representations of texts that describe a central male narrator who yearns for an unattainable female object of desire, although the registers of yearning in these cycles are different. *Die schöne Müllerin* (1823) is about a narrator who imagines himself working in a mill and falling in love with the miller's daughter, who, although out of reach, is nevertheless present in a community from which the narrator is not entirely alien. The narrator of *Winterreise*, however, is alienated from both the beloved and her social space before the cycle has even begun.⁶

In *Winterreise* (1827), a male narrator leaves the house of his beloved and wanders a desolate landscape that mirrors the deterioration of his inner landscape as the cycle unfolds.⁷ As Susan Youens has pointed out, the cycle has no clear harmonic unifying factors; musically and textually, it drifts.⁸ The narrator begins by acknowledging that there has always been something wrong in the relationship between himself and the female object. The first song, "Gute Nacht," begins with the

lines "Fremd bin ich eingezogen, / Fremd zieh' ich wieder aus" ("I arrived a stranger, / a stranger I depart").⁹ Why *fremd*? What has marked the narrator so irrevocably as an Other? There is some trauma, flaw, or transgression within the narrator's subjectivity that Schubert represents musically. The apparently undermotivated, obscure transgression generates a conflict between desire for and dread of the beloved in the text. The narrator's inability to reconcile these forces contributes to his psychic estrangement from the social conventions that support his subjectivity by the end of the cycle of poems.

In *Winterreise*, Schubert represents the narrator's subjectivity in music in two ways. The first is a structure of representation in which there is an apparently stable discrepancy between the narrator's thoughts and the language and music he uses to represent them. This is the letter reaching its *first* destination. To use another Žižekian formulation, this is "remembering to forget." "Remembering to forget" means that we behave as if there were a connection between what we "know" are arbitrary signifiers and signifieds, the conventions of social space, that red means "stop" and green means "go," for example. In order to function in social space, we need to remember to forget the arbitrary structures that are the underpinnings of language, the law, and social space.¹⁰

In the second structure of representation, a traumatic kernel that resists symbolization emerges from conventionality and threatens its cohesiveness. To refer to another Žižekian formulation, this is "forgetting to forget."¹¹

More specifically, one of the most common signifiers of the letter arriving at its first destination in *Winterreise* is the conventional usage of the major and minor modes to represent the narrator meditating on his past and present. In other words, the narrator "remembers to forget" to use our Žižekian formulation; he constructs and is supported by the fantasy structure of representation, in which, for example, the minor mode denotes "sadness" and the major mode "happy" flight into memory and/or fantasy. The letter arriving at its second destination in the cycle is represented by the narrator experiencing traumatic shock, the collapse of his conventional fantasy support and a sense of being flooded by immediate sensations.

Susan Youens argues that the cycle is informed by a binary oscilla-

ines "Fremd bin ich eingezogen, / Fremd zieh' ich wieder aus" ("I arrived a stranger, / a stranger I depart")?⁹ Why *fremd*? What has marked the narrator so irrevocably as an Other? There is some trauma, flaw, or transgression within the narrator's subjectivity that Schubert represents musically. The apparently undermotivated, obscure transgression generates a conflict between desire for and dread of the beloved in the text. The narrator's inability to reconcile these forces contributes to his psychic estrangement from the social conventions that support his subjectivity by the end of the cycle of poems.

In *Winterreise*, Schubert represents the narrator's subjectivity in music in two ways. The first is a structure of representation in which there is an apparently stable discrepancy between the narrator's thoughts and the language and music he uses to represent them. This is the letter reaching its *first* destination. To use another Žižekian formulation, this is "remembering to forget." "Remembering to forget" means that we behave as if there were a connection between what we "know" are arbitrary signifiers and signifieds, the conventions of social pace, that red means "stop" and green means "go," for example. In order to function in social space, we need to remember to forget the arbitrary structures that are the underpinnings of language, the law, and social space.¹⁰

In the second structure of representation, a traumatic kernel that resists symbolization emerges from conventionality and threatens its cohesiveness. To refer to another Žižekian formulation, this is "forgetting to forget."¹¹

More specifically, one of the most common signifiers of the letter arriving at its first destination in *Winterreise* is the conventional usage of the major and minor modes to represent the narrator meditating on his past and present. In other words, the narrator "remembers to forget" to use our Žižekian formulation; he constructs and is supported by the fantasy structure of representation, in which, for example, the minor mode denotes "sadness" and the major mode "happy" flight into memory and/or fantasy. The letter arriving at its second destination in the cycle is represented by the narrator experiencing traumatic shock, the collapse of his conventional fantasy support and a sense of being flooded by immediate sensations.

Susan Youens argues that the cycle is informed by a binary oscilla-

tion between fantasy (signified by the major mode) and reality (signified by the minor mode).¹² There are several moments in the cycle in which a shift from tonic minor to major represents a shift in the text from meditation on the narrator's present to illusion, memory, fantasy, such as the shift from D minor to D major in m. 71 of "Gute Nacht." But the next song, "Die Wetterfahne," has a shift from tonic A minor to A major (mm. 32–33 and 44–46) that represents the narrator's exasperation that his beloved has become a rich bride by marrying another man—hardly a representation of memory, illusion, dream. In "Auf dem Flusse," a turn from tonic E minor to E major (m. 23) likewise represents the narrator's coming to terms with the birth and death of his love as he carves the dates of his love into the frozen surface of a river.¹³ Measure 28 of "Rückblick" illustrates Youens's paradigm as G minor turns to G major to represent the narrator remembering better times. The turn from G minor to G major in "Der Wegweiser," as well, illustrates the narrator turning from an obsessive meditation on his journey (G minor) to a fanciful meditation on the question of the culpability of his subjectivity (G major).

Shifts from tonic major to tonic minor do often signify a shift in the text from fantasy to "reality" as in the shift from E major to E minor in m. 29 of "Der Lindenbaum," the shift from Eb major to Eb minor in mm. 27 and 72 of "Die Post," the shift from A major to A minor in m. 22 of "Täuschung," and the shift from A major to A minor in m. 16 of "Die Nebensonnen." But what about this major/minor structure and "Der Leierman" with its open drone fifth Bb-F#? And why does Schubert set minor to major mode shifts to texts that represent anger and frustration ("Die Wetterfahne" and "Auf dem Flusse")? Why does Schubert use the major mode to signify the flooding of the narrator's psyche with sensations from his immanent experience in "Einsamkeit" and "Der greise Kopf"? On the surface, the minor mode seems to signify connection between the narrator's psyche and his experience; the major mode seems to signify a discrepancy between these registers. But *Winterreise* is about the musical representation of a different kind of "immediacy" that is sometimes associated with the major mode, sometimes with the minor mode. *Winterreise* is a textual and musical representation of the narrator trying to sustain the illusion of signification and *failing*. When the music moves from a minor key to its parallel

major *or* from a major key to its parallel minor, the conventionality of musical representation is in place precisely because this conventionality is based on affective associations of major signifying happiness and minor signifying sadness in Western art music.¹⁴

Schubert's "first" *Winterreise* was a cycle of twelve songs set to poems by Wilhelm Müller in February 1827. Schubert set poems that represent a male narrator in crisis with his own desire as a musical representation of conventionality in "Gute Nacht" that "opens" to moments of traumatic shock by the end of the cycle; see, in particular, the discussion of "Einsamkeit" below. After several months, Schubert discovered additional poems in Müller's cycle and wrote twelve more songs that he added on to his original twelve-song cycle in October 1827. In his new settings, Schubert intensified his musical representation of the poetry's representation of a crisis of subjectivity. Schubert's "second" *Winterreise* begins with a song explicitly about writing, sound, and representation at odds with one another ("Die Post," part 2, song 1), and the cycle ends with a near psychotic break in "Der Leiermann" (part 2, song 12).¹⁵

Part 1 of *Winterreise*

Part 1 of the cycle¹⁶ opens with "Gute Nacht," in which the conventionality of the narrator's self-consciousness is represented in the music through the steady pulse of eighth notes that suggests walking and, by extension, the journey on which he is about to depart. Generally, the expository strophes are set in the tonic minor; at the rhetorical shift to direct address ("Will dich im Traum nicht stören" ["I will not disturb you as you dream"; Wigmore, trans., 365]), the music shifts to tonic major. But the music represents the narrator struggling with an idea that is more complex than this tonic minor/major binary would suggest. The song is all about the narrator trying to contain the "sighing" minor-second interval F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$.

The dyad F $\sharp$ 2-E $\flat$ 2 opens the vocal melody; it is transferred to the lower octave and reaches its hermeneutic destination as it expands to the third F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ -D $\sharp$ (mm. 10-11, 14-15).¹⁷ The downward motion of the register transfer and the completion of the third reinforce the conventional sighing half step. The F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ sigh reverses hopefully as the

major or from a major key to its parallel minor, the conventionality of musical representation is in place precisely because this conventionality is based on affective associations of major signifying happiness and minor signifying sadness in Western art music.¹⁴

Schubert's "first" *Winterreise* was a cycle of twelve songs set to poems by Wilhelm Müller in February 1827. Schubert set poems that present a male narrator in crisis with his own desire as a musical representation of conventionality in "Gute Nacht" that "opens" to moments of traumatic shock by the end of the cycle; see, in particular, the discussion of "Einsamkeit" below. After several months, Schubert discovered additional poems in Müller's cycle and wrote twelve more songs that he added on to his original twelve-song cycle in October 1827. In his new settings, Schubert intensified his musical representation of the poetry's representation of a crisis of subjectivity. Schubert's "second" *Winterreise* begins with a song explicitly about writing, sound, and representation at odds with one another ("Die Post," part 2, song 1), and the cycle ends with a near psychotic break in "Der Leiermann" (part 2, song 12).¹⁵

part 1 of *Winterreise*

part 1 of the cycle¹⁶ opens with "Gute Nacht," in which the conventionality of the narrator's self-consciousness is represented in the music through the steady pulse of eighth notes that suggests walking and, by extension, the journey on which he is about to depart. Generally, the tpository strophes are set in the tonic minor; at the rhetorical shift to direct address ("Will dich im Traum nicht stören" ["I will not disturb you as you dream"; Wigmore, trans., 365]), the music shifts to tonic major. But the music represents the narrator struggling with an idea that is more complex than this tonic minor/major binary would suggest. The song is all about the narrator trying to contain the "sighing" minor-second interval F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$.

The dyad F $\sharp$ ²-E $\flat$ ² opens the vocal melody; it is transferred to the lower octave and reaches its hermeneutic destination as it expands to the third F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ -D $\flat$ (mm. 10–11, 14–15).¹⁷ The downward motion of the register transfer and the completion of the third reinforce the conventional sighing half step. The F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ sigh reverses hopefully as the

music tonicizes the submediant B $\flat$ major through the mediant F major (which becomes its dominant). Moving to the submediant harmony of B $\flat$ major lets Schubert give harmonic significance to a motivic detail: the submediant harmony (mm. 20–23, 52–55) is supported by a B $\flat$ in the bass that is connected to the A $\flat$ in the bass in mm. 27 and 31 and mm. 59 and 63; this A $\flat$ will bring the piece back to D minor in mm. 29 and 65. The B $\flat$ -A $\flat$ voice leading in this passage echoes the F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ sighing motive on a large scale. The "sad" F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ motive opens up to the "happy" whole step F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ in mm. 71–72, only to collapse to the sighing F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ as the music returns to D minor in mm. 97–105.

The sighing motive is also projected on a large scale across the song: the F $\sharp$ ²-E $\flat$ ² motive is echoed by the F $\sharp$ ² (of D major, mm. 71–96)–F $\sharp$ ² (of D minor, mm. 97–105). Finally, the F $\sharp$ ¹-E $\flat$ ¹ sigh is troubled at the famous stumbling motive of the piano introduction to the song on the fourth beat of m. 2. Both notes are *consonant* on one level (F $\sharp$ ¹ is consonant with the bass; E $\flat$ ¹ is a chord tone in the C $\sharp$ fully diminished-seventh chord); both notes are *dissonant* on another level (F $\sharp$ ¹ is not a member of the fully diminished-seventh chord; E $\flat$ ¹ is dissonant with the D $\flat$ in the bass). E $\flat$ is subordinate to F $\sharp$ in mm. 20–21 in the right hand of the accompaniment; F $\sharp$ is supported by the submediant harmony. But, in m. 24, F $\sharp$ is subordinate to E $\flat$; E $\flat$ is a member of the half-diminished-seventh chord of the dominant. The sighing motive seems to be calling out from the mute accompaniment; it is in open octaves and repeated (mm. 24–25, 26–27 in the accompaniment).

Schubert thus represents far more than a conventional association of minor with sadness and major with fantasy; in the collapse of F $\sharp$ ² to F $\sharp$ ² in m. 97, in the stumble of m. 2, and in the reversal of subordinate roles within the submediant key of B $\flat$ major, he shows how there is an instability *within* conventional musical representations that can cause them to shift meanings back and forth across an inscrutable threshold.

After "Gute Nacht," "Die Wetterfahne" is a musical grimace, as the narrator turns to begin his journey. After the close, four-part texture of "Gute Nacht," the unison opening measures of "Die Wetterfahne" sound not just open, but *empty*. This song is about the anxiety of listening. The low octave trills on B $\flat$ represent the rattling of the weather-vane. And the note to which B $\flat$ trills is C $\sharp$ —a shuddering transposition of the "sigh" from "Gute Nacht."

(*leise*) 25
Der Wind spielt dñ - nen mit den Her - zen, wie auf dem Dach, nur nicht so laut

or:
A minor: 1⁶

Example 12. "Die Wetterfahne," mm. 24–28.

Measures 24–28 are a near exact repetition of mm. 5–10, with a crucial difference. In mm. 5–10, the voice doubles the right hand of the accompaniment, which in turn doubles the same line an octave lower in the left hand of the accompaniment. The text here is "Der Wind spielt mit der Wetterfahne auf meines schönen Liebchens Haus" ("The wind is playing with the weather-vane / On my fair sweetheart's house" [Wigmore, trans., 365]). In m. 9, there are fermatas on the E₄s in the accompaniment, while the E₄² in the vocal line dies away. In mm. 24–28, the text is as follows: "Der Wind spielt drinnen mit den Herzen, wie auf dem Dach, nur nicht so laut" ("Inside the wind is playing with hearts, / As on the roof, only less loudly" [Wigmore, trans., 365]). The text of mm. 5–10 describes the house of his beloved; the text of mm. 24–28 internalizes the image as a metaphor for his vulnerable subjectivity. The vocal line of mm. 24–28 contains the same notes as mm. 5–9, but the accompaniment has been lowered an octave. The unison texture thus expands from two octaves (mm. 5–10) to three octaves (mm. 24–28), opening the musical and subjective space of the music. Also, all three "voices" have a fermata on F₄, as if voice and accompaniment were listening to/rememering the F₄-E₄ sigh of "Gute Nacht." See ex. 12. This phrase is repeated once again from mm. 34–39, with the F₄-E₄ sigh emerging even more than in mm. 5–10 and 24–28. In

mm. 35–3
F₄-E₄-F₄
more har
step; in r
turns to
that bring
"Der F
better da
pain. His
mm. 1–1
a success
But Sch
text. Wit
gem Vog
And it i
flooded
had begu
chords i
krähten,
schrien
My eyes
roof" [V
major of
at which
(A minc
rator is l
the don:
F₄²-E₄²
of bird
a scream
is very
turned
24. It s
down a
m. 24 a
This
"Der F

Example 12. "Die Wetterfahne," mm. 24–28.

Example 12. "Die Wetterfahne," mm. 24–28.

Measures 24–28 are a near exact repetition of mm. 5–10, with a crucial difference. In mm. 5–10, the voice doubles the right hand of the accompaniment, which in turn doubles the same line an octave lower in the left hand of the accompaniment. The text here is "Der Wind spielt mit der Wetterfahne auf meines schönen Liebchens Haus" ("The wind is playing with the weather-vane / On my fair sweetheart's house" [Wigmore, trans., 365]). In m. 9, there are fermatas on the E $\sharp$ s in the accompaniment, while the E $\sharp$ 2 in the vocal line dies away. In mm. 24–28, the text is as follows: "Der Wind spielt drinnen mit den Herzen, wie auf dem Dach, nur nicht so laut" ("Inside the wind is playing with hearts, / As on the roof, only less loudly" [Wigmore, trans., 365]). The text of mm. 5–10 describes the house of his beloved; the text of mm. 24–28 internalizes the image as a metaphor for his vulnerable subjectivity. The vocal line of mm. 24–28 contains the same notes as mm. 5–9, but the accompaniment has been lowered an octave. The unison texture thus expands from two octaves (mm. 5–10) to three octaves (mm. 24–28), opening the musical and subjective space of the music. Also, all three "voices" have a fermata on F $\sharp$, as if voice and accompaniment were listening to/remembering the F $\sharp$ -E $\sharp$ sigh of "Gute Nacht." See ex. 12. This phrase is repeated once again from mm. 34–39, with the F $\sharp$ -E $\sharp$ sigh emerging even more than in mm. 5–10 and 24–28. In

mm. 35–36, the "rattling motive" is transposed to F $\sharp$, bringing out an F $\sharp$ -E $\sharp$ -F $\sharp$ -E $\sharp$ motion in the bass from mm. 35–38, and the trill sounds more harsh than earlier. In mm. 4–5, the trill was a close B $\sharp$ -C $\sharp$ half step; in mm. 35–36, it is an augmented second, G $\sharp$ -F $\sharp$. The music returns to a three-octave unison texture in m. 37 with a hard-edge "cut" that brings the F $\sharp$ -E $\sharp$ sigh into relief.

"Der Frühlingstraum" seems to represent the narrator's dreams of better days in the past that are interrupted by the narrator's present pain. His reverie seems to be set by Schubert to the pristine music from mm. 1–14 in A major. Then the narrator's present pain comes back in a succession of minor sonorities culminating in A minor (mm. 22–26). But Schubert connects the two registers in his musical setting of the text. Within the music in A major, Schubert repeats the line "von lustigem Vogelgeschrei" ("And merry bird-calls" [Wigmore, trans., 368]). And it is the idea of sounds of birds that causes the narrator to be flooded by memories of the traumatic expulsion with which the cycle had begun. Schubert sets the following lines to a progression of minor chords in first inversion that lead to A minor: "Und als die Hähne krächten, / Da ward mein Auge wach; / Da war es kalt und finster, / Es schrieen [sic] die Raben vom Dach" ("And when the cocks crowed / My eyes awoke; / It was cold and dark, / Ravens cawed from the roof" [Wigmore, trans., 368]). This is not only a shift from the tonic major of "Der Frühlingstraum" to its parallel minor but a destination at which the narrator is brought back to the key of "Die Wetterfahne" (A minor). At the moment in "Der Frühlingstraum" at which the narrator is brought back to his traumatic memory, the music is poised on the dominant of A minor, and the vocal line in m. 21 erupts with the F $\sharp$ 2-E $\sharp$ 2 sighing motive. See ex. 13. The peaceful, conventional fantasy of bird song, "Vogelgeschrei," in A major nightmarishly opens up into a scream: "es schrieen [sic] die Raben vom Dach." The note F $\sharp$ 2 in m. 21 is very dissonant; it adds a ninth to the dominant harmony. This sigh turned scream in m. 21 moves into the accompaniment from mm. 22–24. It sounds as if the piano tried to sustain holding the sigh motive down at the pitch level F $\sharp$ 1-E $\sharp$ 1 and failed. The piano plays F $\sharp$ 2-E $\sharp$ 2 in m. 24 as a premonition of the vocal reiteration of the motive in m. 25.

This (re)emergence of F $\sharp$ 2-E $\sharp$ 2 is a cross-referential detail linking "Der Frühlingstraum," "Die Wetterfahne," and "Gute Nacht." The

18 wach, da war es kalt und fin - ster, es

21 schrie - en die Ra - ben vom Dach, da war es kalt und

D minor: i F $\sharp$ +6 i $\flat$ G minor: i $\flat$ F $\sharp$ +6 i $\flat$ A minor: iv $\flat$ 6

Example 13. "Der Frühlingstraum," mm. 18–23.

pitch class F $\sharp$ is also enharmonically respelled as E $\sharp$ in "Der Frühlingstraum" itself. In m. 2, E $\sharp$ conventionally points to the submediant F $\sharp$ minor. As I have suggested above, it is also the enharmonically respelled F $\sharp$ of the cross-referential sighing motive.

The verb tenses in "Der Frühlingstraum" are crucial: "Und als die Hähne krähten, / Da *ward* mein Auge wach, / Da *war* es kalt und finster, / es *schrieen* [sic] die Raben vom Dach" ("And when the cocks *crowed* / My eyes *awoke*; / It *was* cold and dark, / Ravens *cawed* from the roof" [Wigmore, trans., 368]).¹⁸ The text is not saying that the narrator's fantasy is brought up short by his present pain because his pain is explicitly located in the past of "Gute Nacht" and "Die Wetterfahne." The triplet octaves in mm. 16, 18, and 20, the climactic A $\flat$ s in m. 22, and the A $\flat$ octaves of mm. 42–43 and 86–87 suggest a cross-reference to the musical materials of "Die Wetterfahne." The muddy sound of the final A-minor chord closes the song in m. 88.¹⁹

"Einsamkeit
Schubert first
with a conven-
to the motion
reiterated B $\flat$ s
geht, / wenn i
dark cloud / I
In the fir-tops
tone A $\sharp$ as Sch-
to the wander
mit tragen F
Gruss" ("Thu
joyful life, / I
bass moves av
since the mus
the music hac
with the fully
notes were di
For the ph
our E $\sharp$ for a
Wetterfahne"
The narrator
whose bright
die Welt so li
is so bright!"
lapse of the r
any way. M
world is set
enharmonica
chord of A r
half-step sigl
cycle. Here,
kernel of the
tasy.²¹ The n
is embedded
the "sigh." S
The text
offers conve

18

wach, da war es kalt und fin - ster, es

schne - en die Ra - ben vom Dach, da war es kalt und

D minor: i $\text{Fr}^{\text{+6}}$ i^6 $\text{Fr}^{\text{+6}}$ i^6 A minor: iv i^6

21

v $\frac{8}{4}$ $\frac{3}{4}$

Example 13. "Der Frühlingstraum," mm. 18–23.

pitch class F $\sharp$ is also enharmonically respelled as E $\sharp$ in "Der Frühlingstraum" itself. In m. 2, E $\sharp$ conventionally points to the submediant F $\sharp$ minor. As I have suggested above, it is also the enharmonically respelled F $\sharp$ of the cross-referential sighing motive.

The verb tenses in "Der Frühlingstraum" are crucial: "Und als die Hähne krähten, / Da ward mein Auge wach, / Da war es kalt und finster, / es schrieen [sic] die Raben vom Dach" ("And when the cocks crowed / My eyes awoke; / It was cold and dark, / Ravens cawed from the roof" [Wigmore, trans., 368]).¹⁸ The text is not saying that the narrator's fantasy is brought up short by his present pain because his pain is explicitly located in the past of "Gute Nacht" and "Die Wetterfahne." The triplet octaves in mm. 16, 18, and 20, the climactic Als in m. 22, and the A $\flat$ octaves of mm. 42–43 and 86–87 suggest a cross-reference to the musical materials of "Die Wetterfahne." The muddy sound of the final A-minor chord closes the song in m. 88.¹⁹

"Einsamkeit" follows "Der Frühlingstraum" and ends the cycle as Schubert first conceived it; the piece is in B minor.²⁰ The text begins with a conventional metaphor that compares the narrator's wandering to the motion of a cloud. Schubert sets the metaphor to B minor with reiterated B $\flat$ s in the bass: "Wie eine trübe Wolke / durch heitere Lüfte geht, / wenn in der Tanne Wipfel / ein mattes Lüftchen weht" ("As a dark cloud / Drifts through clear skies, / When a faint breeze blows / In the fir-tops" [Wigmore, trans., 369]). The bass moves to the leading tone A $\sharp$ as Schubert sets the text that associates the motion of the cloud to the wanderings of the narrator: "So zieh' ich meine Strasse / Dahin mit trägern Fuss, / Durch helles, frohes Leben, / Einsam und ohne Gruss" ("Thus I go on my way, / With weary steps, through / Bright, joyful life, / Alone, greeted by no one" [Wigmore, trans., 369]). The bass moves away from its tonic pedal on the word *zieh*—a musical pun since the music moves on a word that suggests suspension or tension; the music had been pulling earlier in the song, such as in mm. 3 and 5 with the fully diminished-seventh chord of the dominant, all of whose notes were dissonant ("pulling") with the bass B $\flat$ except the G $\flat$.

For the phrases *trägem Fuss* and *ohne Gruss*, Schubert brings back our E $\sharp$ for a guest appearance, with the open octaves that recall "Die Wetterfahne" one last time in the cycle as Schubert first thought of it. The narrator is overwhelmed in the phrases that follow with a world whose brightness horrifies him: "Ach, dass die Luft so ruhig, ach, dass die Welt so licht" ("Alas, that the air is so calm! / Alas, that the world is so bright!") [Wigmore, trans., 369]). These lines are all about the collapse of the narrator's previous metaphor; the world is not like him in any way. Musically, the traumatic split between the narrator and the world is set to reiterated progressions in A major, in which E $\sharp$ gets enharmonically respelled (again) as F $\sharp$ in the fully diminished-seventh chord of A major. Each progression is followed by an eruption of the half-step sighing motion that we have been tracking throughout the cycle. Here, it sounds less like a conventional sigh than a traumatic kernel of the narrator's experience that resists incorporation into fantasy.²¹ The musical representation of resistance is the F-E motive that is embedded within the brief tonicization of A major *and* emerges as the "sigh." See ex. 14.

The text clearly states that inner turmoil reflected in the world offers conventional solace. Schubert sets the line "Als noch die Stürme

tobren" ("When storms were still raging" [Wigmore, trans., 369]) with conventional word painting in mm. 28–30. Measures 35–42 repeat mm. 23–30 with one difference. Instead of the reiterated progression of a fully diminished-seventh chord moving to A major (mm. 24–25, 26–27), the harmony of mm. 36–39 is directional; a fully diminished-seventh chord of G major leads to G major, followed by a fully diminished-seventh chord of A major leading to A major.²² After a prolongation of the dominant, the song closes on B minor. For me, this change drives home the narrator's fate, with the stepwise ascent G major, A major, B *minor*—the nail in the coffin of the narrator's hope. The nail is driven home, so to speak, not on the arrival of B minor but on the downbeat of m. 45. The F♯ in an inner voice is supported by a dominant-seventh chord of the Neapolitan in m. 42 through the first beat and a half of m. 44. In the upbeat to m. 45, F♯ is enharmonically respelled as E♯, the sharp-four scale degree of the German augmented-sixth chord leading to the dominant of B minor. The metaphoric nail is, of course, none other than our guest E♯, which (re)appears from an inner voice. The raised fourth scale degree moves *up* to the fifth scale degree as the flattened sixth moves *down* to the fifth scale degree in mm. 32–33 and 44–45, right between reiterations of the word *elend* (misery) in the text.²³ The E♯ is subtly prepared by the F♯ in an inner voice in m. 43, and the E♯-F♯-E♯ sighing motion binds "Einsamkeit" to "Gute Nacht" with which the cycle had begun. See ex. 15. The example, with its echo of the sighing motive of "Gute Nacht," suggests that Schubert

Example 14. "Einsamkeit," mm. 23–27.

Example 15. "Einsamkeit," mm. 43–48.

has ended part 1 with the letter reaching its first destination. Yes, the second destination is reached in mm. 24–27 and 36–39, but the representation of conventionality is in place at the close of "Einsamkeit" as the narrator is able to represent his suffering. Conventionality is indexed clearly into the music. Notice how the sigh motives in mm. 25 and 27 become internalized by the inner voice preceding the final cadence shown in ex. 15. As we will see below, the ending of part 2 differs in crucial ways from the ending of part 1.

Part 2 of *Winterreise*

Like part 1, part 2²⁴ opens with a troubled, conventional musical representation of disappointment in "Die Post" that seems to turn on a shift from the "hopeful" tonic major, E♭ major, to the "sad" tonic minor, E♭ minor, to depict the narrator's disappointment when he realizes that he will not get a letter from his beloved. The song turns, not on this consideration of mode, but on the relation between vocal line and accompaniment in the E♭-major part of the song and on the significance of musical repetition. The song is in two parts (stanzas 1–2 and 3–4) set

to exactly the same music; this song represents the paradox of a letter (not) arriving at its destination *twice*. Each part of the text represents one of these (non)arrivals of the letter. Here is the text to the first two stanzas of "Die Post"; I omit Schubert's repetition of phrases:

Von der Strasse her ein Posthorn klingt.
Was hat es, dass es so hoch aufspringt,
Mein Herz?

Die Post bringt keinen Brief für dich.
Was drängst du denn so wunderbarlich,
Mein Herz?

A posthorn sounds from the road.
Why is it that you leap so high,
My heart?

The post brings no letter for you.
Why, then, do you surge so strangely,
My heart? [Wigmore, trans., 369]

In the first stanza, the narrator hears the sounds of a post horn; the dotted rhythms and dominant-tonic harmonies of the opening measures represent, perhaps, a horse and the simply diatonic sound of a post horn.²⁵ In the second line, the narrator asks why "it" is springing so high, and the German *es* could refer to the *Posthorn* or *Herz*. The first, declarative sentence that describes what is happening is set by Schubert to plain dominant-tonic harmonies in E♭ major. The second line that sets up the slippage in metaphor among the sound of the horn, the galloping of the postman's horse, and the excitement of the narrator is set to a rapid modulation first to the subdominant (A♭ major), then to the subdominant of the subdominant (D♭ major). See ex. 16. This is a musical "springing up" to dominant-preparation chords that could lead to a decisive dominant-tonic cadence. Instead of this diatonic cadence, Schubert sets a repetition of line 2 to a chromatically descending bass (D♭ in mm. 15–16, C♯ in m. 17, C♭ in m. 18, to B♭ in m. 19) that resolves to tonic in m. 24. The rapid springing up to the subdominant of the subdominant sets the narrator's heart's hope that there is a metaphoric relation between its galloping and the galloping of the postman's horse, between an external image of excitement and

to exactly the same music; this song represents the paradox of a letter (not) arriving at its destination *twice*. Each part of the text represents one of these (non)arrivals of the letter. Here is the text to the first two stanzas of "Die Post"; I omit Schubert's repetition of phrases:

Von der Strasse her ein Posthorn klingt.
Was hat es, dass es so hoch aufspringt,
Mein Herz?

Die Post bringt keinen Brief für dich.
Was drängst du denn so wunderbarlich,
Mein Herz?

A posthorn sounds from the road.
Why is it that you leap so high,
My heart?

The post brings no letter for you.
Why, then, do you surge so strangely,
My heart? [Wigmore, trans., 369]

In the first stanza, the narrator hears the sounds of a post horn; the dotted rhythms and dominant-tonic harmonies of the opening measures represent, perhaps, a horse and the simply diatonic sound of a post horn.²⁵ In the second line, the narrator asks why "it" is springing so high, and the German *es* could refer to the *Posthorn* or *Herz*. The first, declarative sentence that describes what is happening is set by Schubert to plain dominant-tonic harmonies in E^b major. The second line that sets up the slippage in metaphor among the sound of the horn, the galloping of the postman's horse, and the excitement of the narrator is set to a rapid modulation first to the subdominant (A^b major), then to the subdominant of the subdominant (D^b major). See ex. 16. This is a musical "springing up" to dominant-preparation chords that could lead to a decisive dominant-tonic cadence. Instead of this diatonic cadence, Schubert sets a repetition of line 2 to a chromatically descending bass (D^b in mm. 15–16, C^b in m. 17, C^b in m. 18, to B^b in m. 19) that resolves to tonic in m. 24. The rapid springing up to the subdominant of the subdominant sets the narrator's heart's hope that there is a metaphoric relation between its galloping and the galloping of the postman's horse, between an external image of excitement and

Example 16. "Die Post," mm. 11–15.

Example 17. "Die Post," mm. 16–20.

an internal one. But the accompaniment is "aware" of something of which the vocal line is not; during the vocal rests in mm. 16–18, the space between the tonic and the subdominant of the subdominant that had been opened with leaping fourths (E^b / A^b / D^b) deflates to a chromatically descending third in the bass (D^b-C^b-B^b). See ex. 17. The German augmented-sixth chord of m. 18 moving to the dominant reminds me of the German augmented-sixth chord that had driven the nail into the coffin of the narrator's hopes in m. 44 of "Einsamkeit."

The space in the text between the two stanzas is set by Schubert as a measure of silence—m. 26. This measure silences the heart's desire for a metaphoric relation to the external world; the pulse of the music continues, but it is not connected to notes. The arrival of E^b minor

is connected *rhythmically* to the music in E $\flat$ major; a fermata would have severed such a connection. The connection between E $\flat$ major and E $\flat$ minor is also implicit in Schubert's treatment of E $\flat$ major. During the accompaniment's chromatic descent from the subdominant of the subdominant to the dominant of E $\flat$ via the German augmented-sixth chord, all the accidentals of E $\flat$ minor have been "added" to the key signature (D $\flat$ in m. 12, G $\flat$ in m. 13, and C $\flat$ in m. 18). The diatonic, bright sound of E $\flat$ major that sets the declarative first sentence in the text unravels to represent the moment at which the metaphoric slippage occurs.

Schubert sets the beginning of the second stanza to E $\flat$ minor, which moves down stepwise to D $\flat$ major in m. 30; D $\flat$ had been the subdominant of the subdominant in E $\flat$ major, the signifier of leaping hope of the heart/the sound of the post horn/a desire for a metaphoric connection among these images. Schubert links *Dich* in the first line of the second stanza to *mein Herz* in the first stanza through D $\flat$ major triads that occur in m. 15 and m. 30. I have suggested above that, when the vocal line is singing, the music represents its desire and that, when the vocal line rests, the music represents something more—a slippage in the metaphoric signification suggested above (mm. 16–19) and a rupture in the metaphoric connection between the narrator's heart and external images (m. 26). Thus, D $\flat$ represents the heart that the narrator incessantly questions in the song. This process continues in the setting of the rest of the second stanza as the leaping motion continues to G $\flat$ major (the subdominant of the subdominant of the subdominant of E $\flat$ major). Schubert concludes his setting of the second stanza to an extension of the diatonic dominant-tonic harmony of his setting of the first line of the first stanza.

Schubert sets stanzas 3 and 4 to the exact same music:

Nun ja, die Post kommt aus der Stadt,
Wo ich ein liebes Liebchen hat',
Mein Herz!

Willst wohl einmal hinübersehn,
Und fragen, wie es dort mag gehn,
Mein Herz?

is connected *rhythmically* to the music in E $\flat$ major; a fermata would have severed such a connection. The connection between E $\flat$ major and E $\flat$ minor is also implicit in Schubert's treatment of E $\flat$ major. During the accompaniment's chromatic descent from the subdominant of the subdominant to the dominant of E $\flat$ via the German augmented-sixth chord, all the accidentals of E $\flat$ minor have been "added" to the key signature (D $\flat$ in m. 12, G $\flat$ in m. 13, and C $\flat$ in m. 18). The diatonic, bright sound of E $\flat$ major that sets the declarative first sentence in the text unravels to represent the moment at which the metaphoric slippage occurs.

Schubert sets the beginning of the second stanza to E $\flat$ minor, which moves down stepwise to D $\flat$ major in m. 30; D $\flat$ had been the subdominant of the subdominant in E $\flat$ major, the signifier of leaping hope of the heart/the sound of the post horn/a desire for a metaphoric connection among these images. Schubert links *Dich* in the first line of the second stanza to *mein Herz* in the first stanza through D $\flat$ major triads that occur in m. 15 and m. 30. I have suggested above that, when the vocal line is singing, the music represents its desire and that, when the vocal line rests, the music represents something more—a slippage in the metaphoric signification suggested above (mm. 16–19) and a rupture in the metaphoric connection between the narrator's heart and external images (m. 26). Thus, D $\flat$ represents the heart that the narrator incessantly questions in the song. This process continues in the setting of the rest of the second stanza as the leaping motion continues to G $\flat$ major (the subdominant of the subdominant of the subdominant of E $\flat$ major). Schubert concludes his setting of the second stanza to an extension of the diatonic dominant-tonic harmony of his setting of the first line of the first stanza.

Schubert sets stanzas 3 and 4 to the exact same music:

Nun ja, die Post kommt aus der Stadt,
Wo ich ein liebes Liebchen hat',
Mein Herz!

Willst wohl einmal hinübersehn,
Und fragen, wie es dort mag gehn,
Mein Herz?

But yes, the post comes from the town
Where I once had a beloved sweetheart,
My heart!

Do you want to peep out
And ask how things are there,
My heart? [Wigmore, trans., 369]

These lines represent the second (non)arrival of the beloved's letter. Stanzas 1–2 depict the narrator's hope and disappointment, first that he does not get a letter from his beloved, and that there is a metaphoric slippage between his heart and external images. He seems to hear the postman's horn, doesn't get a letter, and reacts by exploring the discrepancy between the absence of a letter and his pounding heart's driving rhythm. But, in stanzas 3–4, we discover, retrospectively, that stanzas 1–2 had been a fantasy—a textual and musical representation of desire anterior to a potential arrival of a letter. Stanzas 3–4 depict the postman actually coming, and, as he does, the narrator's attention swerves away from the postman and the knowledge that he does not have a letter for the narrator, and the narrator ponders the connection between the postman and his point of origin (not destination). The (non)letter thus arrives in this song for a second time since the letter in "Die Post" is, in fact, "a letter in a bottle." In *Enjoy Your Symptom*, Žižek discusses a letter always reaching its destination as soon as it is placed in circulation; that is, a message in a bottle (*Flaschenpost*) always reaches its destination despite the fact that it is addressed to no one. Its destination is the imagined reader whom the sender imagines him/herself to reach as soon as his/her hand lets it go.

The letter paradoxically bears in its silence the message of the alienation of the narrator from not only his beloved but the social order in which she lives. The poignancy of the second part of the text lies in the narrator's attempt to transform a passive experience of seeing desire unravel into an active experience of going back to the letter's point of origin. Schubert connects these seemingly different registers of experience (passive to active) to the same, exact music, to make the song musically clear about letters reaching their destination twice in apparently different but profoundly similar ways.

The narrator reiterates question after question to his heart concern-

ing desire in the setting of stanzas 1–2. This is the first (non)arrival of the letter in the song; its first (non)arrival is its anticipation within the subjectivity of the narrator. When voice and accompaniment sound together, the music leaps in hope to the subdominant of the subdominant of the subdominant. When the voice rests, the accompaniment slips. In the setting of stanzas 3–4, the narrator reiterates question after question to his heart concerning the letter as something to be *sent*, not received. He wants to reenter the social space from which he has been severed; the letter (which he cannot send, as the unanswered questions attest) is one that he wants to send back to a projection of himself before he was separated from social space. Schubert's exact repetition of the music of stanzas 1–2 in stanzas 3–4 irrevocably grounds the futility of both gestures in the structure of desire that can never reach its object. The first necessary failure of the letter to reach its destination is set by Schubert as the unraveling of conventional musical representation as the voice rests; in the second part, the same vocal rests represent the failure of the narrator even to send out a message in a bottle.

At the outset of "Der greise Kopf," the note $A\flat$ is subordinate to $G\sharp$, the fifth scale degree of tonic C minor. The upper neighbor $A\flat-G\sharp$ is present in m. 1 in the accompaniment; in mm. 1–3, $A\flat^1$ is transferred to $A\flat^2$; the harmony of mm. 2–3 is a fully diminished-seventh chord of the tonic C minor over a C pedal. In m. 7, Schubert associates the narrator's illusion that he has grown old (as if the snow on his head were white hair) with the note $A\flat$ given the song's first vocal embellishment in m. 7. The misrecognition of the narrator is not just that the snow is snow and his young hair is young hair but that his subjectivity depends on a correspondence between his psyche and the outside world. The misrecognition that asserts the metaphoric relation between snow, his suffering, his desire for death, and the external world is in place precisely because of this traditional $A\flat-G\sharp$ neighbor motion. The pleasure this misrecognition gives the narrator is represented by Schubert in $A\flat$ being enharmonically respelled as $G\sharp$ in mm. 11–16; Schubert tonicizes A minor (the raised submediant of C minor) and then G major (the dominant of C minor). The text to this articulation of the raised submediant and the dominant is "Da glaubt' ich schon ein Greis zu sein, / Und hab mich sehr gefreut" ("I thought I was already an old man, / And I rejoiced" [Wigmore, trans., 369]). See ex. 18. In the example,

ing desire in the setting of stanzas 1–2. This is the first (non)arrival of the letter in the song; its first (non)arrival is its anticipation within the subjectivity of the narrator. When voice and accompaniment sound together, the music leaps in hope to the subdominant of the subdominant of the subdominant. When the voice rests, the accompaniment slips. In the setting of stanzas 3–4, the narrator reiterates question after question to his heart concerning the letter as something to be *sent*, not received. He wants to reenter the social space from which he has been severed; the letter (which he cannot send, as the unanswered questions attest) is one that he wants to send back to a projection of himself before he was separated from social space. Schubert's exact repetition of the music of stanzas 1–2 in stanzas 3–4 irrevocably grounds the futility of both gestures in the structure of desire that can never reach its object. The first necessary failure of the letter to reach its destination is set by Schubert as the unraveling of conventional musical representation as the voice rests; in the second part, the same vocal rests represent the failure of the narrator even to send out a message in a bottle.

At the outset of “Der greise Kopf,” the note Ab is subordinate to G♯, the fifth scale degree of tonic C minor. The upper neighbor Ab–G♯ is present in m. 1 in the accompaniment; in mm. 1–3, Ab¹ is transferred to Ab²; the harmony of mm. 2–3 is a fully diminished-seventh chord of the tonic C minor over a C pedal. In m. 7, Schubert associates the narrator's illusion that he has grown old (as if the snow on his head were white hair) with the note Ab given the song's first vocal embellishment in m. 7. The misrecognition of the narrator is not just that the snow is snow and his young hair is young hair but that his subjectivity depends on a correspondence between his psyche and the outside world. The misrecognition that asserts the metaphoric relation between snow, his suffering, his desire for death, and the external world is in place precisely because of this traditional Ab–G♯ neighbor motion. The pleasure this misrecognition gives the narrator is represented by Schubert in Ab being enharmonically respelled as G♯ in mm. 11–16; Schubert tonicizes A minor (the raised submediant of C minor) and then G major (the dominant of C minor). The text to this articulation of the raised submediant and the dominant is “Da glaubt' ich schon ein Greis zu sein, / Und hab mich sehr gefreut” (“I thought I was already an old man, / And I rejoiced” [Wigmore, trans., 369]). See ex. 18. In the example,

The musical score for Schubert's "Der greise Kopf" (Winterreise, mm. 6-14) is presented. The vocal line and piano accompaniment are shown. The vocal line includes the lyrics: "wei - ßen Schein mir ü - bers Haar ge - streu - et. Da glaubt' ich schon ein Greis zu sein, und hab mich sehr ge - freu - et." The piano accompaniment features a C minor key signature and various chordal textures, including a fully diminished-seventh chord in mm. 2-3. An example of a diminished-seventh chord is shown below the main score, labeled "C minor: vii°5 i becomes A minor: vii°5 i".

Example 18. “Der greise Kopf,” mm. 6–14.

the connection between Ab and G♯ is clear; the B♭ fully diminished-seventh chord (dominant substitute in C minor) is respelled as a G♯ fully diminished-seventh chord (dominant substitute of the raised submediant in C minor).

Ab pulls away from its conventional neighbor motion as Schubert sets the lines “Doch bald ist er hinweggetaut, / Hab wieder schwarze Haare, / Dass mir's vor meiner Jugend graut” (“But soon it melted away; / Once again I have black hair, / So that I shudder at my youth” [Wigmore, trans., 369]). The text represents the metaphoric relation collapsing; the narrator simply has black, young hair; and the lack of a correspondence between the narrator and his environment is horrifying to him. A passage in octaves reminiscent of “Die Wetterfahne”

Measure 20: *Haa - re, daß mir's vor mei - ner Ju - gend grant — wie*

Measure 21: *weit noch his zur Bah - rei wie weit noch his zur Bah - rei Vom*

Measure 22: *or: 25 26 27 28 29 30*

Measure 23: *25 26 27 28 29 30*

Measure 24: *25 26 27 28 29 30*

Measure 25: *25 26 27 28 29 30*

Measure 26: *25 26 27 28 29 30*

Measure 27: *25 26 27 28 29 30*

Measure 28: *25 26 27 28 29 30*

Measure 29: *25 26 27 28 29 30*

Measure 30: *25 26 27 28 29 30*

Example 19. "Der greise Kopf," mm. 20–29.

opens up the space between the $A\flat$ of m. 20 and the $G\sharp$ of C minor in m. 29. See ex. 19.

Notice that the unison line shown in ex. 19 shows rhetorical and musically metrical accents on $C\sharp$ in m. 25 setting *weit*, $A\flat$ in m. 27 setting a reiteration of *weit*, and $G\sharp$ in m. 29—the dominant of tonic C minor. The music is an excruciating setting of the text; the yearning for the grave in the text is set to a large-scale descending major third. The silence of the text as the music sounds the dominant in m. 29 represents the horror that the half step $A\flat$ - $G\sharp$ brings the narrator not forward to the grave but right back where he started. Notice how the $C\sharp$ - $A\flat$ - $G\sharp$ motion suggests a slow motion in two-measure groupings—a representation of the narrator's funeral desire. The return to tonic in m. 30 comes one measure "too soon"—a representation of the shock of the return to his present suffering.

Measure 40 is moorings. At the of a half-diminist the measure. This motion governs t "Täuschung" i that conventiona of the text, the n light on his wan contrast to this r to A minor in m. represents, there to $C\sharp$. Schubert third $A\flat$ - $A\sharp$ - $B\flat$ - F dinating it to A (re)assert tonic accompaniment in mm. 28–30. *Täuschung* ist f me!" [Wigmore narrator's subject *Täuschung* is not tery of conventi of this song, illi inscribe $C\sharp$ as B "Die Neben tionality is sect (re)appears onc bass in m. 12, minor) later in music sounds E sonnen] nicht v trans., 372]]. Se After the son cally repelled Nacht," and th sion that initia

The musical score for measures 20-29 of Schubert's *Winterreise* is presented in G major and 3/4 time. The vocal line (treble clef) and piano accompaniment (bass clef) are shown. The lyrics are: "Hör - te, daß mei - ne - ner Ju - gend grant - wie weit noch bis zur Bah - rei! wie weit noch bis zur Bah - rei! Vom weit noch bis zur Bah - rei! wie weit noch bis zur Bah - rei! Vom". The score includes chord symbols: V⁴ Major: I, V² II, IV⁶, V⁷. The piano part features a prominent descending major third in measure 29, which is a key element of the text's meaning.

Example 19. "Der greise Kopf," mm. 20–29.

opens up the space between the Ab of m. 20 and the G $\sharp$ of C minor in m. 29. See ex. 19.

Notice that the unison line shown in ex. 19 shows rhetorical and musically metrical accents on C $\sharp$ in m. 25 setting *weit*, Ab in m. 27 setting a reiteration of *weit*, and G $\sharp$ in m. 29—the dominant of tonic C minor. The music is an excruciating setting of the text; the yearning for the grave in the text is set to a large-scale descending major third. The silence of the text as the music sounds the dominant in m. 29 represents the horror that the half step Ab-G $\sharp$ brings the narrator not forward to the grave but right back where he started. Notice how the C $\sharp$ -Ab-G $\sharp$ motion suggests a slow motion in two-measure groupings—a representation of the narrator's funeral desire. The return to tonic in m. 30 comes one measure "too soon"—a representation of the shock of the return to his present suffering.

Measure 40 is crucial for the representation of Ab's conventional moorings. At the beginning of m. 40, Ab emerges from an inner voice of a half-diminished-seventh chord to move to the bass by the end of the measure. This is the first and last time in the song that the Ab-G $\sharp$ motion governs the *bass*.

"Täuschung" is structured similarly; it is a song about the support that conventional representation provides the narrator. In the first part of the text, the narrator acknowledges that he is following an illusory light on his wanderings; the lilting A major sonorities seem an ironic contrast to this recognition of illusion. But, as soon as the music turns to A minor in m. 22, we see that, underneath the illusion that the song represents, there is unbearable pain—represented by the collapse of C $\sharp$ to C $\flat$. Schubert not only moves back to A major, but he fills in the third A $\flat$ -A $\sharp$ -B $\flat$ -B $\sharp$ -C $\sharp$ from mm. 28–31, respelling C $\sharp$ as B $\sharp$ and subordinating it to A major. The violence of this rising line of half steps that (re)assert tonic A major is reflected in the accompaniment; the lilting accompaniment figures disappear for the first and last time in the song in mm. 28–30. A major then completes the song with the line "Nur Täuschung ist für mich Gewinn" ("Even mere illusion is a boon to me!") [Wigmore, trans., 371]). The meaning of this line is crucial for the narrator's subjectivity as I understand Schubert's representation of it; *Täuschung* is not illusion or disappointment but a self-conscious mastery of conventional means of representation. In the musical language of this song, illusion is the narrator's reward because he is able to reinscribe C $\sharp$ as B $\sharp$ into the orbit of the song's major mode.²⁶

"Die Nebensonnen" is the last song in the cycle in which conventionality is securely in place.²⁷ The E $\flat$ -F $\sharp$ motive of "Gute Nacht" (re)appears once more in the cycle. The pitch class E $\sharp$ appears in the bass in m. 12, a local leading tone to the submediant harmony (F $\sharp$ minor) later in the measure. Notice that, at the precise moment the music sounds E $\sharp$, the text refers to desire: "Als *wollten* sie [die Nebensonnen] nicht weg von mir" ("As if unwilling to leave me" [Wigmore, trans., 372]). See ex. 20.

After the song turns to the parallel minor in m. 16, E $\sharp$ is enharmonically respelled as F $\flat$; the sigh F $\flat$ -E $\flat$ in m. 21 is reminiscent of "Gute Nacht," and the text explicitly reinforces this look back to the expulsion that initiated the cycle; the words *auch wohl* are set to the F $\flat$ -E $\flat$

Example 20. "Die Nebensonnen," mm. 9–13.

Example 21. "Die Nebensonnen," mm. 20–23.

sigh: "Ja, neulich hatt' ich auch wohl drei, / Nun sind hinab die besten zwei" ("Yes, not long ago I, too, had three suns; / Now the two best have set" [Wigmore, trans., 372]). See ex. 21. To the phrase *besten zwei*, Schubert transfers the sigh motive to the bass for a tonicization of the submediant of A minor—F major. F♯ turns back to E♯ in m. 28, and the conventional cycle of enharmonic respellings is closed.

Throughout this analysis of *Winterreise*, I have been arguing that Schubert sets musical representations of notes reaching their first, conventional destination and notes reaching their second destination when the musical materials of the first arrival show signs of strain or collapse. But musical representations of the second destination have always been stained by the conventionality of the first destination. All representations of the second destination are logical impossibilities; it is not possible for any signifying system to represent that which evades its signification.²⁸ But, to vary the title of one of Žižek's books, it is possible to represent the arrival of notes at their second destination by

Example 20. "Die Nebensonnen," mm. 9–13.

Example 21. "Die Nebensonnen," mm. 20–23.

sigh: "Ja, neulich hatt' ich auch wohl drei, / Nun sind hinab die besten zwei" ("Yes, not long ago I, too, had three suns; / Now the two best have set" [Wigmore, trans., 372]). See ex. 21. To the phrase *besten zwei*, Schubert transfers the sigh motive to the bass for a tonicization of the submediant of A minor—F major. F4 turns back to E# in m. 28, and the conventional cycle of enharmonic respellings is closed.

Throughout this analysis of *Winterreise*, I have been arguing that Schubert sets musical representations of notes reaching their first, conventional destination and notes reaching their second destination when the musical materials of the first arrival show signs of strain or collapse. But musical representations of the second destination have always been stained by the conventionality of the first destination. All representations of the second destination are logical impossibilities; it is not possible for any signifying system to represent that which evades its signification.²⁸ But, to vary the title of one of Žižek's books, it is possible to represent the arrival of notes at their second destination by

listening away. "Der Leiermann" is a song that "listens away"; it represents that which lies within yet beyond signification.²⁹ The text of the song is as follows:

Drüben hinter'm Dorfe
Steht ein Leiermann,
Und mit starren Fingern
Dreht er was er kann.

Barfuss auf dem Eise
Schwankt er hin und her;
Und sein kleiner Teller
Bleibt ihm immer leer.

Keiner mag ihn hören,
Keiner sieht ihn an;
Und die Hunde knurren
Um den alten Mann.

Und er lässt es gehen
Alles, wie es will,
Dreht, und seine Leier
Steht ihm nimmer still.

Wunderlicher Alter,
Soll ich mit dir gehen?
Willst zu meinen Liedern
Deine Leier drehen?

There, beyond the village,
Stands an organ-grinder;
With numb fingers
He plays as best he can.

Barefoot on the ice
He totters to and fro,
And his little plate
Remains forever empty.

No one wants to listen,
No one looks at him,

And the dogs growl
Around the old man.

And he lets everything go on
As it will;
He plays, and his hurdy-gurdy
Never stops.

Strange old man,
Shall I go with you?
Will you grind your hurdy-gurdy
To my songs? [Wigmore, trans., 372–73]

The song opens with an eight-measure introduction as shown in ex. 22.³⁰ The first sonority of the song is a vestige of the F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$ sigh. “Gute Nacht” had opened with F $\sharp$ -E $\flat$, and F $\sharp$ has been enharmonically respelled as E $\flat$ in a variety of contexts throughout the cycle. The E $\sharp$ grace note in the bass at the outset of “Der Leiermann” represents, on the surface, trying to get the hurdy-gurdy going. Psychoanalytically, it suggests repetition compulsion—a force that moves again and again to a site of trauma. In m. 3, E $\sharp$ reaches its second destination and stays there as it is absorbed by the B $\flat$ -F $\sharp$ drone.

In the text, the narrator mistakes his fantasy for reality; he forgets to forget not only that subjectivity is supported by an arbitrary network of signifiers but that he has been interested throughout the cycle in maintaining the binary, metaphoric relation between himself and the external world. In “Der Leiermann,” this binary almost totally collapses. The subjective crisis in the text is conveyed by overuse of the conjunction *and*, suggesting an endless series without subordination.

After an eight-measure introduction in the piano, the setting of stanza 1–2 is identical to the setting of stanzas 3–4. This music, repeated

Example 22. “Der Leiermann,” mm. 1–8.

Etwas langsam

The musical score is for the first eight measures of 'Der Leiermann'. It is written for piano. The tempo is marked 'Etwas langsam' (Somewhat slow). The time signature is 3/4. The key signature has two sharps (F# and C#). The melody in the right hand begins with a grace note (E#) on the first measure, followed by a series of eighth and sixteenth notes. The bass line in the left hand consists of a drone of Bb and F#.

And the dogs growl
Around the old man.
And he lets everything go on
As it will;
He plays, and his hurdy-gurdy
Never stops.
Strange old man,
Shall I go with you?
Will you grind your hurdy-gurdy
To my songs? [Wigmore, trans., 372–73]

The song opens with an eight-measure introduction as shown in ex. 22.³⁰ The first sonority of the song is a vestige of the F♯-E♯ sigh. “Gute Nacht” had opened with F♯-E♯, and F♯ has been enharmonically respelled as E♯ in a variety of contexts throughout the cycle. The E♯ grace note in the bass at the outset of “Der Leiermann” represents, on the surface, trying to get the hurdy-gurdy going. Psychoanalytically, it suggests repetition compulsion—a force that moves again and again to a site of trauma. In m. 3, E♯ reaches its second destination and stays there as it is absorbed by the B♭-F♯ drone.

In the text, the narrator mistakes his fantasy for reality; he forgets to forget not only that subjectivity is supported by an arbitrary network of signifiers but that he has been interested throughout the cycle in maintaining the binary, metaphoric relation between himself and the external world. In “Der Leiermann,” this binary almost totally collapses. The subjective crisis in the text is conveyed by overuse of the conjunction *and*, suggesting an endless series without subordination.

After an eight-measure introduction in the piano, the setting of stanzas 1–2 is identical to the setting of stanzas 3–4. This music, repeated

Example 22. “Der Leiermann,” mm. 1–8.

Etwas langsam

Table 1

mm. 1–8	introduction	
mm. 9–10 = mm. 31–32	piano left hand and voice	unit a
mm. 11–12 = mm. 33–34	piano	unit b
mm. 13–14 = mm. 35–36	piano left hand and voice	unit a
mm. 15–16 = mm. 37–38	piano	unit b
mm. 17–18 = mm. 39–40	piano left hand and voice; new idea	unit c
mm. 19–20 = mm. 41–42	piano; new idea	unit d
mm. 21–22 = mm. 43–44	piano left hand and voice	unit c
mm. 23–24 = mm. 45–46	piano	unit d + v.c. ^a
mm. 25–26 = mm. 47–48	piano left hand and voice; new idea	unit c
mm. 27–30 = mm. 49–52	piano; extended material	unit f

^a Voice exchange.

once exactly, is composed of twenty-two measures of two-measure alternating fragments, with one exception at the end, the four-measure fragments mm. 27–30 and 49–52. The precision of this large-scale repetition is illustrated in table 1 with musical ideas given motivic tags represented by lowercase letters.³¹ The extraordinary regularity of this music, its mechanical alternation of two-measure phrases between the voice and the accompaniment, as well as the large-scale repetition of the music to set both stanzas of poetry represent musically the narrator's lack of connection to his own consciousness.³²

Stanzas 1–4 are in third-person narration; the narrator is describing what he sees. In the fifth stanza, the voice shifts to the second person; the narrator addresses the *Leiermann* directly. For me, the narrator has been addressing a projection of himself all along without knowing it. The music's psychotic “forgetting to forget” is signified not only by the mechanically repetitive structures above but by the drone fifth that pervades the music.

Schubert sets the fifth stanza as an incomplete fragment in terms of phrase and pitch structure. After the obsessive two-measure units of the previous fifty-two measures, the piece ends with a single six-measure vocal phrase. The four-measure postlude in the piano is very fragmentary as well. Measure 58 is like m. 49 with one rhythmic and one dynamic change. The dotted rhythm of m. 49 has been eliminated,

9-10 17-18 25-26
13-14 21-22
31-32 39-40 47-48
35-36 43-44

(repeat)

Example 23. "Der Leiermann," overview of the vocal part.

and the dynamic level rises suddenly from *pianissimo* throughout to *forte*—a sudden and dramatic shift. Measures 59–60 are unit b from the setting of the first two stanzas with a dynamic marking that brings the music back to *pianissimo*. The song ends with cadences we have heard at mm. 13 and 17 with middle D $\sharp$ added for tonal clarity.

The texture of the setting of the fifth stanza shifts subtly. No longer is there a clear alternation of two-measure phrases between the voice and the piano; from mm. 53–58, the voice and piano play *together*. This musical togetherness pulls at the text that ends with an unanswered question. The relation between the unanswered question in the text and the music that sets the unanswered question represents the psychosis of the song. We hear what the narrator cannot understand; he has been accompanying himself all along.

A crucial shift in the pitch structure of the vocal part represents the narrator not knowing that his question cannot be answered. Example 23 provides an overview of the vocal part; the example shows that the vocal part clearly outlines the key of B minor and stays within the octave F $\sharp$ ¹–F $\sharp$ ². The example shows that the harmonic implication of the vocal phrases is i–V in mm. 9–10, 13–14, 17–18, 21–22; the vocal line closes on i in B minor for the first time in m. 26 right before the four-measure extension closes out the setting of the first stanza. Note the musical irony of the voice closing on tonic for the first time on the word *leer* (empty).³³ The vocal line in the setting of the fifth stanza disrupts this clear tonal structure. The vocal line in the setting of stanzas 1–4 had plenty of D $\sharp$ s to make the tonal focus clear, and the melodic and

The image displays a musical score for the song "Der Leiermann" from Schubert's *Winterreise*. It features two staves: a vocal line (soprano) and a piano accompaniment line. The vocal line includes measure numbers 9-10, 13-14, 17-18, 21-22, 25-26, 31-32, 39-40, 43-44, 47-48, and 53. The piano part includes measure numbers 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, and 58. Dynamic markings such as *pianissimo* and *forte* are present. The score is marked with a repeat sign at the end of the vocal line.

Example 23. "Der Leiermann," overview of the vocal part.

and the dynamic level rises suddenly from *pianissimo* throughout to *forte*—a sudden and dramatic shift. Measures 59–60 are unit b from the setting of the first two stanzas with a dynamic marking that brings the music back to *pianissimo*. The song ends with cadences we have heard at mm. 13 and 17 with middle $D\sharp$ added for tonal clarity.

The texture of the setting of the fifth stanza shifts subtly. No longer is there a clear alternation of two-measure phrases between the voice and the piano; from mm. 53–58, the voice and piano play *together*. This musical togetherness pulls at the text that ends with an unanswered question. The relation between the unanswered question in the text and the music that sets the unanswered question represents the psychosis of the song. We hear what the narrator cannot understand; he has been accompanying himself all along.

A crucial shift in the pitch structure of the vocal part represents the narrator not knowing that his question cannot be answered. Example 3 provides an overview of the vocal part; the example shows that the vocal part clearly outlines the key of B minor and stays within the octave $F\sharp^1$ – $F\sharp^2$. The example shows that the harmonic implication of the vocal phrases is i – V in mm. 9–10, 13–14, 17–18, 21–22; the vocal line uses on i in B minor for the first time in m. 26 right before the four-measure extension closes out the setting of the first stanza. Note the musical irony of the voice closing on tonic for the first time on the word *er* (empty).³³ The vocal line in the setting of the fifth stanza disrupts its clear tonal structure. The vocal line in the setting of stanzas 1–4 and plenty of $D\sharp$ s to make the tonal focus clear, and the melodic and

harmonic close on B minor clear in mm. 26 and 48. In the vocal setting of the fifth stanza, there is only one $D\sharp$, a passing sixteenth note, and the vocal part hauntingly stresses $F\sharp$ at $F\sharp^1$ and $F\sharp^2$ pitch levels. The $F\sharp^1$ – $F\sharp^2$ octave had been the limits of the voice for the settings of the first four stanzas; for the setting of the fifth stanza, the limit is strained. The deep structure of the vocal part from mm. 9–48 is a B-minor scale or a B-minor triad; the deep structure of the vocal part from mm. 53–58 is an open $F\sharp^1$ – $F\sharp^2$ octave suggesting the dominant. And, of course, the dominant represents the harmonic correlate of the unanswerable question in the text. Furthermore, the octave limit is breached by two upper neighbors in mm. 56–57. The repetition of the $G\sharp^2$ – $F\sharp^2$ neighbor fuses what the narrator can never know. The text asks whether the Leiermann would like to play "my songs" ($G\sharp^2$ – $F\sharp^2$) on "your hurdy-gurdy" ($G\sharp^2$ – $F\sharp^2$). They are one and the same.

Schubert ends the cycle with the letter having reached its second destination—not death as the narrator so desires throughout the cycle, but something much worse, contact with a piece of the inscrutable Real.³⁴

Having taken a rather large-grain approach to issues of music theory, musicology, and psychoanalysis in *Winterreise* in this chapter, the next chapter probes in much greater detail how two late Schubert songs index their psychoanalytic features into precise details of musical-theoretical analysis. The psychoanalysis will probe mirror fantasies, doubles, and the gaze in music; the music theory will focus on Schenkerian voice-leading graphs of the songs.